UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, Department of Justice, Antitrust Division 450 Fifth Street NW, Suite 4000 Washington, DC 20530,

Plaintiff,

v.

Case No. 1:20-cv-3356

NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF REALTORS® 430 North Michigan Ave. Chicago, IL 60611,

Defendant.

COMPLAINT

The United States of America brings this civil antitrust action to obtain equitable relief against Defendant National Association of REALTORS®. The United States alleges as follows:

I. NATURE OF THE ACTION

1. Defendant National Association of REALTORS® ("NAR") has adopted a series of rules, policies, and practices governing, among other things, the publication and marketing of real estate, real estate broker commissions, as well as real estate broker access to lockboxes, that have been widely adopted by NAR's members resulting in a lessening of competition among real estate brokers to the detriment of American home buyers. These NAR rules, policies, and practices include:

- (a) prohibiting NAR-affiliated multiple-listing services ("MLSs") from disclosing to prospective buyers the amount of commission that the buyer broker will earn if the buyer purchases a home listed on the MLS;
- (b) allowing buyer brokers to misrepresent to buyers that a buyer broker's services are free;
- enabling buyer brokers to filter MLS listings based on the level of buyer broker commissions offered and to exclude homes with lower commissions from consideration by potential home buyers; and
- (d) limiting access to the lockboxes that provide licensed brokers with physical access to a home that is for sale to only brokers who are members of a NAR-affiliated MLS.
- 2. These NAR rules, policies, and practices have been widely adopted and enforced by NAR-affiliated MLSs, and are, therefore, agreements among competing real estate brokers each of which reduce price competition among brokers and lead to lower quality service for American home buyers and sellers. Together, the agreements also have a cumulative anticompetitive effect. The agreements individually and collectively unreasonably restrain trade in violation of Section 1 of the Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1, and should be enjoined.
- 3. Accordingly, the United States seeks an order requiring NAR to cease its activities with respect to these rules, policies, and practices and providing additional relief.

II. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

4. NAR is engaged in interstate commerce and in activities substantially affecting interstate commerce. NAR transacts business throughout the United States. NAR's membership includes brokers and agents that conduct business across the United States in the local areas in

which each member operates. NAR's rules, policies, and practices govern the conduct of its members in all 50 states, including the conduct of all of NAR's individual member brokers and their affiliated agents and sales associates ("REALTORS®"). The anticompetitive rules, policies, and practices alleged in this Complaint violate the Sherman Act and affect home buyers and sellers located throughout the United States. The Court has subject matter jurisdiction under Section 4 of the Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. § 4, to prevent and restrain NAR from violating Section 1 of the Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1.

5. NAR has consented to venue and personal jurisdiction in this District. Venue is also proper in this judicial district under 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)(1).

III. THE DEFENDANT

6. NAR is a trade association organized under the laws of Illinois with its principal place of business in Chicago. It is the leading national trade association of real estate brokers and agents. Among its members are licensed residential real estate brokers, including brokers who provide real estate brokerage services to home sellers ("listing brokers"), home buyers ("buyer brokers"), or both (collectively "residential brokers").

IV. INDUSTRY BACKGROUND

- 7. Among other activities, NAR establishes and enforces rules, policies, and practices, that are adopted by NAR's 1,400+ local associations (also called "Member Boards") and their affiliated MLSs that govern the conduct of NAR's approximately 1.4 million-member REALTORS® who are engaged in residential real estate brokerages across the United States.
- 8. The real estate brokerage business by its nature tends to be local. Most buyers and sellers prefer to work with a broker who is familiar with local market conditions. As a result,

NAR's member brokers and agents compete with one another in local listing broker and buyer broker service markets to provide real estate brokerage services to home sellers and home buyers.

- 9. MLSs are joint ventures among competing brokers to facilitate the publishing and sharing of information about homes for sale in a geographic area. The membership of an MLS is generally comprised of nearly all residential real estate brokers and their affiliated agents in an MLS's service area. The geographic coverage of the MLS serving an area normally establishes the geographic market in which competition among brokers occurs, although meaningful competition among brokers may also occur in smaller areas, like a particular area of a city, in which case that smaller area may also be a relevant geographic market.
- 10. In each area an MLS serves, the MLS will include or "list" the vast majority of homes that are for sale through a residential real estate broker in that area. In most areas, the local MLS provides the most up-to-date, accurate, and comprehensive compilation of the area's home listings. Listing brokers will use the MLS to market sellers' properties to other broker and agent participants in the MLS and, through those other brokers and agents, to potential home buyers. By virtue of nearly industry-wide participation and control over important data, brokers offering MLSs possess and exercise market power in the markets for the provision of real estate brokerage services to home buyers and sellers in local markets throughout the country.
- 11. NAR, through its Member Boards, controls a substantial number of the MLSs in the United States. NAR promulgates rules, policies, and practices governing the conduct of NAR-affiliated MLSs that are set forth annually in the *Handbook on Multiple Listing Policy* ("Handbook"). Under the terms of the Handbook, affiliated REALTOR® associations and MLSs "must conform their governing documents to the mandatory MLS policies established by [NAR's] Board of Directors to ensure continued status as member boards and to ensure coverage under the

master professional liability insurance program." National Association of REALTORS®, Handbook on Multiple Listing Policy 2020 (32nd ed. 2020), at iii.

12. NAR and its affiliated REALTOR® associations and MLSs enforce the Handbook's rules, policies, and practices as well as the rules, policies, and practices codified in NAR's Code of Ethics. NAR's Code of Ethics states that "[a]ny Member Board which shall neglect or refuse to maintain and enforce the Code of Ethics with respect to the business activities of its members may, after due notice and opportunity for hearing, be expelled by the Board of Directors from membership in the National Association." National Association of REALTORS®, Procedures for Consideration of Alleged Violations of Article IV, Section 2, Bylaws.

V. THE UNLAWFUL AGREEMENTS

- 13. NAR's Handbook and NAR's Code of Ethics impose certain rules, policies, and practices on NAR-affiliated MLSs that affect competition for the provision of buyer broker services among those participating in a given MLS. In addition, some MLSs employ certain practices that are not directly required by a NAR rule or policy, but that similarly affect competition for the provision of buyer broker services among those participating in an MLS.
- 14. These rules, policies, and practices include: prohibiting an MLS from disclosing to prospective buyers the amount of commission that the buyer broker will earn if the buyer purchases a home listed on the MLS ("NAR's Commission Concealment Rules"); allowing buyer brokers to mislead buyers into thinking that buyer broker services are free ("NAR's Free-Service Rule"); enabling buyer brokers to filter MLS listings based on the level of buyer broker commissions offered and to exclude homes with lower commissions from consideration by potential home buyers ("NAR's Commission-Filter Rules and Practices"); and limiting access to lockboxes that

provide licensed brokers physical access to a home that is for sale to only those real estate brokers who are members of a NAR-affiliated MLS ("NAR's Lockbox Policy").

15. NAR's and its affiliated MLSs' adoption and enforcement of these rules, policies, and practices which are described in more detail below, reflect concerted action between horizontal competitors and constitute agreements among competing real estate brokers that reduce price competition among brokers and lead to higher prices and lower quality service for American home buyers and sellers.

A. NAR's Commission-Concealment Rules

- 16. NAR's Commission-Concealment Rules recommend that MLSs prohibit disclosing to prospective buyers the total commissions offered to buyer brokers. Such concealment likely leads to higher prices and lower quality for buyer broker services. All or nearly all of NAR-affiliated MLSs have adopted a prohibition on disclosing commissions offered to buyer brokers. This means that while buyer brokers can see the commission that is being offered to them if their home buyer purchases a specific property—a commission that will ultimately be paid through the home purchase price that the home buyer, represented by the buyer broker, pays—MLSs conceal this fee from home buyers.
- 17. The Commission-Concealment Rules are laid out in several places in NAR's *Handbook*, including Policy Statement 7.58, Policy Statement 7.23, Policy Statement 7.3; Section IV.1.a of the Virtual Office Websites Policy; and Sections 18.3.1 and 19.15 of the Model MLS Rules.
- 18. NAR's Commission-Concealment Rules relieve buyer brokers from the necessity of competing against each other by offering rebates or offering to accept lower commissions. NAR's Commission-Concealment Rules also make home buyers both less likely and less able to

negotiate a discount or rebate off the offered commission. Finally, NAR's Commission-Concealment Rules encourage and perpetuate the setting of persistently high commission offers by sellers and their listing agents. The result is higher prices for buyer broker services.

19. Buyer brokers may, in fact, steer potential home buyers away from properties with low commission offers by filtering out, failing to show, or denigrating homes listed for sale that offer lower commissions than other properties in the area. When buyers cannot see commission offers, they cannot detect or resist this type of steering. Steering not only results in higher prices for buyer broker services, it also reduces the quality of the services that are rendered to the potential home buyer, making it less likely that the buyer will ultimately be matched with the optimal home choice. Fear of having buyers steered away from a property is also a strong deterrent to sellers who would otherwise offer lower buyer broker commissions, which further contributes to higher prices for buyer broker services.

B. NAR's Free-Service Rule

20. Because commissions are offered by home sellers, and buyers do not pay their buyer brokers directly, it can be difficult for buyers to appreciate that they are nevertheless sharing with the seller the cost of the buyer broker's services. NAR's Free-Services Rule, which has been widely adopted by NAR-affiliated MLSs, compounds this problem by allowing buyer brokers to mislead buyers into thinking that the buyer broker's services are free when they are not. Under the NAR Code of Ethics, "Unless they are receiving no compensation from any source for their time and service, REALTORS® may use the term 'free' and similar terms in their advertising and in other representations only if they clearly and conspicuously disclose: (1) by whom they are being, or expect to be, paid; (2) the amount of the payment or anticipated payment; (3) any condition

associated with the payment, offered product or service, and; (4) any other terms relating to their compensation." (See NAR Code of Ethics, Standard of Practice 12-1).

21. NAR's Free-Services Rule allows brokers to mislead buyers by obscuring the fact that buyers have a stake in what their buyer brokers are being paid for their services. Buyer broker fees, though nominally paid by the home's seller, are ultimately paid out of the funds from the purchase price of the house. If buyers are told that buyer broker services are "free," buyers are less likely to think to negotiate a lower buyer broker commission or to view buyer broker rebate offers as attractive. In these ways, NAR's Free-Services Rule likely leads to higher prices for services provided by buyer brokers.

C. NAR'S Commission-Filter Rules and Practices

- 22. NAR's Commission-Filter Rules and Practices allow buyer brokers to filter MLS listings that will be shown to buyers based on the level of buyer broker commissions offered. Once this filtering is performed, some MLSs further permit buyer brokers to affirmatively choose not to show certain homes to potential home buyers if the buyer broker will make less money because of lower commissions. Homes may be filtered out in this manner even if they otherwise meet the buyer's home search criteria. For example, buyer brokers or agents may use an MLS's software to filter out any listing where a buyer broker will receive less than 2.5% commission on the home sale. The buyer broker would then provide to its home buyer customer only those listings where the buyer broker would be paid a 2.5% commission or more if the home sale is completed.
- 23. According to Policy Statement 7.58 of NAR's Handbook, for example, "Participants may select the IDX listings they choose to display based only on objective criteria including . . . cooperative compensation offered by listing brokers." Handbook, at 24 (Policy Statement 7.58); see also id. at 43 (VOW Policy) ("A VOW may exclude listings from display

based only on objective criteria, including . . . cooperative compensation offered by listing broker, or whether the listing broker is a Realtor®.").

24. NAR's Commission-Filter Rules and Practices, which have been widely adopted by NAR-affiliated MLSs, facilitates steering by helping buyer brokers conceal from potential home buyers any property listings offering lower buyer broker commissions. As alleged above, the practice of steering buyers away from homes with lower buyer broker commissions likely reduces the quality of buyer broker services and raises prices for buyer broker services, both at the expense of home buyers.

D. NAR's Lockbox Policy

- 25. NAR and its members have also adopted a policy and practice that limits access to lockboxes to only those real estate brokers who are members of a NAR-affiliated MLS. Lockboxes hold the keys to a house to allow brokers and potential buyers to access homes for sale, with permission from the selling home owner, while continuing to keep the homes secure. Such lockboxes are accessed by a real estate broker using a numerical code or digital Bluetooth® 'key' enabling the real estate broker to show buyers homes that are listed for sale.
- 26. NAR and its affiliated MLSs have adopted a series of rules (set forth in the NAR Handbook, Policy Statement 7.31) that limit access to lockboxes only to those real estate brokers that are members of NAR and subscribe to the NAR-affiliated MLS. Licensed, but non-NAR-affiliated brokers are not allowed to access the lockboxes, thereby depriving those brokers the ability to show homes listed for sale. This policy and practice effectively deprives licensed real estate brokers that are not members of NAR from accessing properties for sale to show potential home buyers, thereby lessening competition for buyer broker services.

VI. VIOLATION OF SECTION 1 OF THE SHERMAN ACT

- 27. NAR's real estate broker members are direct competitors for the provision of listing-broker and buyer broker services. Through the rules, policies, and practices alleged above and challenged in this action, NAR has coordinated and enforced anticompetitive agreements, which have likely contributed to reduced price competition among buyer brokers and a lower quality of buyer broker services for home buyers.
- 28. When adopted by NAR Member Boards, the NAR rules, policies, and practices alleged above and challenged in this action are horizontal agreements that govern and enforce the conduct of competing MLS brokers and agents that deny prospective home buyers access to relevant information resulting in higher prices and lower quality for buyer broker services.
- 29. The NAR rules, policies, and practices alleged above and challenged in this action have an anticompetitive effect in the relevant markets and unreasonably restrain trade in violation of Section 1 of the Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1.

VII. REQUESTED RELIEF

- 30. The United States requests that this Court:
 - (a) adjudge that the NAR rules, policies, and practices challenged in this action are unreasonable restraints of trade and interstate commerce, in violation of Section 1 of the Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1;
 - (b) enjoin and restrain NAR from promulgating, enforcing, or adhering to any rules, policies, or practices that unreasonably restrict competition;
 - (c) permanently enjoin and restrain NAR from establishing the same or similar rules, policies, or practices as those challenged in this action in the future, except as prescribed by the Court;

- (d) award the United States such other relief as the Court may deem just and proper to redress and prevent recurrence of the alleged violations and to dissipate the anticompetitive effects of the illegal agreements entered into by NAR; and
- (e) award the United States the costs of this action.

Respectfully submitted,

COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES

Dated: November 19, 2020

/s/ Makan Delrahim
MAKAN DELRAHIM (D.C. Bar #457795)
Assistant Attorney General
Antitrust Division
/s/ Michael F. Murray
MICHAEL F. MURRAY (D.C. Bar #1001680)
Deputy Assistant Attorney General
/s/ Owen M. Kendler
OWEN M. KENDLER
Chief

/s/ Lisa A. Scanlon

LISA A. SCANLON
Assistant Chief
Media, Entertainment, and Professional
Services Section
U.S. DOJ, Antitrust Division
450 Fifth St., NW, Suite 4000
Washington, DC 20001
Tel. 202.305.8376
owen.kendler@usdoj.gov
lisa.scanlon@usdoj.gov

/s/ Samer M. Musallam

Samer M. Musallam* (DC Bar # 986077)
U.S. Department of Justice
Antitrust Division
950 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Suite 3110
Washington, DC 20530
Tel. 202.598.2990
Fax: 202.514.9033
samer.musallam@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for the United States

*LEAD ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CIVIL COVER SHEET

IS-44 (Rev. 11/2020 DC)							
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS		D	DEFENDANTS				
(b) COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES) (c) ATTORNEYS (FIRM NAME, ADDRESS, AND TELEPHONE NUMBER)			COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED DEFENDANT (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED ATTORNEYS (IF KNOWN)				
II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (PLACE AN x IN ONE BOX ONLY)		III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES (PLACE AN X IN ONE BOX FOR PLAINTIFF AND ONE BOX FOR DEFENDANT) FOR DIVERSITY CASES ONLY!					
	ederal Question S. Government Not a Party)	Citizen of this		corporated or Principal Place O 4 O 4 Business in This State			
Defendant (I	ndicate Citizenship of	Citizen of And	o z o z In	corporated and Principal Place O 5 O 5			
P		Citizen or Subject of a O 3 O 3		oreign Nation O 6 O 6			
			ND NATURE OF SUIT				
(Place an X in one cate	gory, A-N, that best represen	nts your Ca	use of Action and one in a co	rresponding Nature of Suit)			
A10 Antitrust	Personal Injury/ Malpractice		Administrative Agency Review	O D. Temporary Restraining Order/Preliminary Injunction			
310 Airplane 315 Airplane Product Liability 320 Assault, Libel & Slander 330 Federal Employers Liability 340 Marine 345 Marine Product Liability 350 Motor Vehicle 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability 360 Other Personal Injury 362 Medical Malpractice 365 Product Liability 367 Health Care/Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability 368 Asbestos Product Liability		Other Statutes 891 Agricultural Acts 893 Environmental Matters 890 Other Statutory Actions (If		Any nature of suit from any category may be selected for this category of case assignment. *(If Antitrust, then A governs)*			
O E. General Civil (Other)	OR	0	F. Pro Se General Civil	1			
Real Property 210 Land Condemnation 220 Foreclosure 230 Rent, Lease & Ejectment 240 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property Personal Property Bankruptcy 422 Appeal 27 USC 15 423 Withdrawal 28 US Prisoner Petitions 535 Death Penalty 540 Mandamus & Ott 550 Civil Rights 555 Prison Conditions		C 157	Federal Tax Suits 870 Taxes (US plaintiff of defendant) 871 IRS-Third Party 26 7609 Forfeiture/Penalty 625 Drug Related Seizur Property 21 USC 88 690 Other	USC 470 Racketeer Influenced & Corrupt Organization 480 Consumer Credit 485 Telephone Consumer Protection Act (TCPA)			
370 Other Fraud 371 Truth in Lending 380 Other Personal Property Damage 385 Property Damage Product Liability	560 Civil Detainee – Cor of Confinement Property Rights 820 Copyrights 830 Patent 835 Patent – Abbreviate Drug Application 840 Trademark 880 Defend Trade Secre 2016 (DTSA)	ed New	Other Statutes 375 False Claims Act 376 Qui Tam (31 USC 3729(a)) 400 State Reapportionm 430 Banks & Banking 450 Commerce/ICC Rate 460 Deportation 462 Naturalization Application	Exchange 896 Arbitration 899 Administrative Procedure Act/Review or Appeal of Agency Decision 950 Constitutionality of State Statutes			

O G. Habeas Corpus/ 2255	O H. Employment Discrimination	O I. FOIA/Privacy Act	O J. Student Loan			
530 Habeas Corpus – General 510 Motion/Vacate Sentence 463 Habeas Corpus – Alien Detainee	442 Civil Rights – Employment (criteria: race, gender/sex, national origin, discrimination, disability, age, religion, retaliation)	895 Freedom of Information Act 890 Other Statutory Actions (if Privacy Act)	152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loan (excluding veterans)			
	(If pro se, select this deck)	*(If pro se, select this deck)*				
O K. Labor/ERISA (non-employment) 710 Fair Labor Standards Act 720 Labor/Mgmt. Relations 740 Labor Railway Act 751 Family and Medical Leave Act 790 Other Labor Litigation 791 Empl. Ret. Inc. Security Act	O L. Other Civil Rights (non-employment) 441 Voting (if not Voting Rights Act) 443 Housing/Accommodations 440 Other Civil Rights 445 Americans w/Disabilities – Employment 446 Americans w/Disabilities – Other 448 Education	110 Insurance 120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits 160 Stockholder's Suits 190 Other Contracts 195 Contract Product Liability 196 Franchise	O N. Three-Judge Court 441 Civil Rights – Voting (if Voting Rights Act)			
V. ORIGIN						
O 1 Original O 2 Removed O 3 Remanded O 4 Reinstated O 5 Transferred From Appeal to O 8 Multi-district O 7 Appeal to O 8 Multi-district O 8 Multi-district O 8 Multi-district O 8 Multi-district O 8 M						
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION (CITE THE U.S. CIVIL STATUTE UNDER WHICH YOU ARE FILING AND WRITE A BRIEF STATEMENT OF CAUSE.)						
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT	CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER F.R.C.P. 23 DEMAND \$ JURY DEMAND: YES		YES only if demanded in complaint NO			
VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY	(See instruction) YES	NO If yes, 1	olease complete related case form			
DATE:	SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF REC	CORDSamer M. Musale	lam			

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET JS-44 Authority for Civil Cover Sheet

The JS-44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and services of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. Listed below are tips for completing the civil cover sheet. These tips coincide with the Roman Numerals on the cover sheet.

- I. COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF/DEFENDANT (b) County of residence: Use 11001 to indicate plaintiff if resident of Washington, DC, 88888 if plaintiff is resident of United States but not Washington, DC, and 99999 if plaintiff is outside the United States.
- III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES: This section is completed only if diversity of citizenship was selected as the Basis of Jurisdiction under Section II.
- IV. CASE ASSIGNMENT AND NATURE OF SUIT: The assignment of a judge to your case will depend on the category you select that best represents the <u>primary</u> cause of action found in your complaint. You may select only <u>one</u> category. You <u>must</u> also select <u>one</u> corresponding nature of suit found under the category of the case.
- VI. CAUSE OF ACTION: Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing and write a brief statement of the primary cause.
- VIII. RELATED CASE(S), IF ANY: If you indicated that there is a related case, you must complete a related case form, which may be obtained from the Clerk's Office.

Because of the need for accurate and complete information, you should ensure the accuracy of the information provided prior to signing the form.